



MARK D. SCOTT
CABINET SECRETARY

**STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA
DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATION
PURCHASING DIVISION**

W. MICHAEL SHEETS
DIRECTOR

April 24, 2023

Terry L. Hess, Director
West Virginia Bureau of Senior Services
3003 Charleston Town Center, 3rd Floor
Charleston, West Virginia 25389

Dear Director Hess:

This is to transmit the final copy of the Purchasing Review of the West Virginia Bureau of Senior Services.

A preliminary copy of this report was submitted to your agency for comment. Where significant comments were returned by your agency, we have included those as part of this final review report.

A Corrective Action Plan Request will follow requesting your response to all the compliance issues identified in this report.

Thank you for your cooperation and that of your staff during this review.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "W. Michael Sheets".

W. Michael Sheets, CPPO
Director
West Virginia Purchasing Division

Enclosure

cc: Ashley J. Mong, Procurement Specialist, West Virginia Bureau of Senior Services
Denise Worley, Commissioner of West Virginia Bureau of Senior Services

WV PURCHASING DIVISION INSPECTION REPORT

BOARDS & COMMISSIONS

West Virginia Bureau of Senior Services

FISCAL YEAR
2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. *Introduction* 2

2. *Scope of Inspection* 3

3. *Inspection Summary* 4

4. *Detailed Inspection Findings*..... *Exhibit A*

5. *Comparison with Prior Inspections*..... *Exhibit B*

6. *Agency Training Report*..... *Exhibit C*

7. *Agency Response* *Exhibit D*

INTRODUCTION

The Purchasing Division is broadly charged with the development and oversight of the procurement functions of state spending units under its authority. That authority is found in Chapter 5A, Article 3 of the West Virginia Code, and Title 148, Series 1, of the West Virginia Code of State Rules. That mandate requires that the Purchasing Division “appoint inspectors to review and audit spending unit requests and purchases and other transactions and performance.” W. Va. CSR § 148-1-4.14. The Purchasing Division’s Inspection Services Unit performs this function by regularly conducting inspections of all spending units subject to Purchasing Division oversight.

The Purchasing Division Inspection Services Unit conducted a remote inspection of the Bureau of Senior Services for the period of July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2022. Notice of the inspection was provided on March 20, 2023, and the inspection commenced on March 29, 2023. The results of the inspection are contained within this report.

SCOPE

The scope of the inspection was focused on determining whether the Bureau of Senior Service's procurement transactions for the period of July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2022 were, in all material respects, in compliance with applicable provisions of the West Virginia Code, the Code of State Rules and the Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook in effect during that time period.

Inspectors utilized spending unit payment transactions to identify potential violations with a primary focus on those transactions processed at the spending unit level without Purchasing Division involvement. Those transactions included, but were not limited to, agency delegated procurements, Section 9 procurements, agency delivery orders, General Accounting Expenditure ("GAX") payments, and P-Card payments. Notwithstanding this general focus, however, Inspectors can review any transaction or internal procurement operating procedures that they deem relevant.

As noted above, the transaction review was conducted to ensure compliance with applicable provisions of the West Virginia Code, the Code of State Rules and the Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook. More specifically, the scope of the inspection included, but was not limited to, an examination to determine if any of the following infractions had been committed:

- (1) Failure to bid at central level (Stringing)[Required to be reported to the Legislature twice annually]
- (2) Failure to bid at delegated level,
- (3) Statewide contract not utilized,
- (4) Vendor registration unverified and wrong vendor fee exemption code utilized
- (5) Failure to verify compliance checks
 - a. Unemployment
 - b. Workers' compensation
 - c. Vendor status with Secretary of State's office
 - d. Debarred vendor list
- (6) Failure to include notarized Purchasing Affidavit,
- (7) Failure to issue wvOASIS procurement award document,
- (8) Lack of compliance with fixed asset requirements (asset tags),
- (9) Failure to include Certification of Non-Conflict of Interest form,
- (10) Miscellaneous Issues
 - a. Improper award (Unjustified award to other than lowest responsible bidder meeting specifications),
 - b. Leases exceeding six months not processed centrally
 - c. Other as needed

SUMMARY

During the period under review, the spending unit processed 363 procurement transactions with a value of \$170,235.12. These amounts are approximate, subject to reporting limitations from wvOASIS (including possible data entry error and errors caused by elimination of duplicate results). Of those transactions, the Inspector selected 20 for review, which represents approximately 4% of the total. This inspection of 20 selected transactions yielded 22 findings associated with 8 of the selected transactions. This means that approximately 40% of the transactions reviewed had one or more instances of noncompliance with applicable provisions of the West Virginia Code, the Code of State Rules and the Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook.

The inspection also revealed that on 4 occasions, the spending unit failed to obtain competitive bids as required by the applicable dollar level of spend. That number is comprised of 0 instances of failing to bid at the central level (also known as stringing), and 4 instances of failing to bid at the delegated level. Any instances of failure to bid at the central level will be reported to the Legislature as required by the West Virginia Code.

Based on the findings contained in this report, the Purchasing Division recommends the spending unit work to improve any areas of noncompliance. Given that there was a pattern of findings, the first step must be the completion of a Corrective Action Plan, a request for which will be provided to you after this inspection is finalized.

EXHIBIT A: DETAILED INSPECTION FINDINGS

Issue 1: Failure to bid at central level (Stringing)

Authority: W. Va. Code § 5A-3-10; Procedures Handbook Section 6

Explanation: State law mandates that the Purchasing Division competitively bid for the purchase of commodities and services estimated to exceed twenty-five thousand dollars. The law also prohibits a spending unit from issuing a series of requisitions or divide or plan procurements to circumvent this twenty-five thousand dollar threshold. The transactions listed below violated this legal mandate and will be reported to the West Virginia Legislature as required by law.

Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit establish central contracts through the Purchasing Division for each of the items included above and any other commodities or services that will exceed \$25,000 in a rolling 12 month period.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit utilize wvOASIS to create reports that will allow the spending unit to track spend and determine when spending is closing to exceeding the \$25,000 limit.
3. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit forecast future needs for its commodities and services to determine in advance what should be procured at the central level.
4. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

Issue 2: Failure to bid at delegated level

Authority: W. Va. Code § 5A-3-11(a); W. Va. CSR § 148-1-7.2; Procedures Handbook Section 5

Explanation: The Purchasing Division has established competitive bidding requirements that spending units must follow when procuring commodities and services below \$25,000.01, and above \$2,500.00. For those transactions listed below, the spending unit has failed to obtain and document competitive bids as required.

Transactions in Violation: (4 Instances)

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
09/20/2021	Technical assistant service	Jennifer J Fazzolari	\$2,800.00	GAX,22*21539
01/19/2022	Technical assistant service	Jennifer J Fazzolari	\$2,702.00	GAX,22*56444

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
06/02/2022	Conference calling	NTT Cloud Communications	\$92.94	PRCC,22*58460
06/03/2022	Internet	Suddenlink Business	\$773.00	PRCC,22*58460

Additional Detail: Although the individual transactions listed above fall below the verbal bid limit, the agency aggregate spent for each vendor exceeded \$2,500.00 for the fiscal year under review.

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit follow the requirements associated with each delegated spending limit.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit utilize wvOASIS to create reports that will allow the spending unit to track spend and determine when spending is closing to exceeding spending limits.
3. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit forecast future needs for its commodities and services to determine in advance what should be competitively bid at delegated verbal and written bid levels.

4. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

Issue 3: Statewide Contract Not Utilized

Authority: W. Va. CSR § 148-1-7.4.c.; Procedures Handbook Section 3.6.2

Explanation: The Purchasing Division has authority to establish contracts at a statewide level to secure economies of scale that would not be possible on an agency by agency basis. Once established, the Purchasing Division can mandate that spending units utilize those statewide contracts. For the transactions listed below, the spending unit has obtained the commodity or service in question outside of an available statewide contract without a valid waiver.

Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit personnel become familiar with what is available from statewide contracts and either procure those commodities and services from statewide contracts or obtain a waiver from the Purchasing Division.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.
3. Agencies should issue a delivery order to obtain goods or services from central open-end contracts unless the West Virginia State Auditor's Office has approved an alternate ordering and payment method.
4. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

Issue 4: Vendor Registration Unverified/Wrong Vendor Fee Exemption Code Utilized

Authority: W. Va. CSR § 148-1-6.1; Procedures Handbook Section 4

Explanation: The agency must verify that the vendor is registered, and the registration fee paid, if applicable. The registration process includes having the proper disclosure of information in the wvOASIS vendor/customer account. Certain vendors are exempted from paying the vendor registration fee mandated by the authority referenced above. wvOASIS has created fee exemption codes that allow the spending unit to designate the appropriate exemption code on a transactional basis.

Transactions in Violation: (2 Instances)

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
09/20/2021	Technical assistant service	Jennifer J Fazzolari	\$2,800.00	GAX,22*21539
01/19/2022	Technical assistant service	Jennifer J Fazzolari	\$2,702.00	GAX,22*56444

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchase Division recommends that the spending unit only utilize vendor fee exemption codes for transactions that would permit a vendor to avoid paying the vendor registration fee.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.
3. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit contact the Vendor Registration section within the Purchasing Division if there is uncertainty about when and how to apply a vendor fee exemption code.

Issue 5: Failure to Verify Compliance Checks

(Workers Comp, Unemployment, Sec. of State, Debarment)

Authority: W. Va. CSR § 148-1-6.1.e.; Procedures Handbook Section 5.3.1.6.

Explanation: The authority cited above requires that a vendor be licensed and in good standing in accordance with all state and local laws and requirements by any state or local agency of West Virginia, including, but not limited to, the West Virginia Secretary of State's Office, the West Virginia Tax Department, West Virginia Insurance Commission, or other state agencies or political subdivisions prior to being awarded a contract. The mandated compliance checks were not included in the transactions listed below.

Transactions in Violation: (5 Instances)

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
06/30/2022	Dues	Advancing States Inc.	\$11,554.00	GAX,22*27738
12/31/2021	Dues	Meals on Wheels America	\$4,229.17	GAX,22*08402
10/29/2021	Conference	NCCNHR	\$4,800.00	PRCC,22*40328

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
06/02/2022	Conference calling	NTT Cloud Communications	\$92.94	PRCC,22*58460
06/03/2022	Internet	Suddenlink Business	\$773.00	PRCC,22*58460

Additional Detail: Although the individual transactions listed above fall below the verbal bid limit, the agency aggregate spent for each vendor exceeded \$2,500.00 for the fiscal year under review.

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit perform all compliance checks mandated by the Handbook and properly document those compliance checks in the contract file.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

Issue 6: Purchasing Affidavit Not Included

Authority: W. Va. Code §§ 5A-3-10a and 5-22-1; Procedures Handbook Section 5.3.1.6.

Explanation: West Virginia law has several restrictions against awarding a contract to a vendor that owes a debt to the State or its political subdivisions. The Purchasing Affidavit must be signed by the vendor prior to contract award to obtain assurance that the vendor is in compliance with the statutory mandates.

Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit obtain a properly completed Purchasing Affidavit and maintain a copy in the contract file for all transactions exceeding \$10,000.00 (the threshold for obtaining written bids).
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

Issue 7: wvOASIS Award Document Not Issued

Authority: Procedures Handbook Section 5.2.2

Explanation: The Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook requires that a procurement award document be issued for all purchases exceeding \$2,500 in value. This requirement ensures that the transaction is recorded in wvOASIS in a way that allows it to be easily identified and tracked and helps to prevent spending in violation of procurement laws, rules, and procedures.

Transactions in Violation: (5 Instances)

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
06/30/2022	Dues	Advancing States Inc.	\$11,554.00	GAX,22*27738
09/20/2021	Technical assistant service	Jennifer J Fazzolari	\$2,800.00	GAX,22*21539
01/19/2022	Technical assistant service	Jennifer J Fazzolari	\$2,702.00	GAX,22*56444
12/31/2021	Dues	Meals on Wheels America	\$4,229.17	GAX,22*08402
10/29/2021	Conference	NCCNHR	\$4,800.00	PRCC,22*40328

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit issue a purchase order through wvOASIS and maintain a copy in the contract file for all transactions exceeding \$2,500.00.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

Issue 8: Asset Tag Not Affixed

Authority: W. Va. Code § 5A-3-34; Surplus Property Operations Manual, Part II, Section 1.4

Explanation: The Surplus Property Operations Manual requires that all reportable assets must have a numbered identification tag affixed to the asset. Agencies are responsible for obtaining and placing the proper tags on the assets. This method of tagging assets helps to easily identify state assets during physical inspection and to guard against asset theft.

Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit obtain a properly affix asset tags to all reportable assets. In conjunction with this, the spending unit must maintain accurate inventory records in wvOASIS.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

Issue 9: Cert. of Non-Conflict Not Included

Authority: W. Va. Code §§ 5A-3-31 and 6B-2-5; Procedures Handbook Section 3.7.7.

Explanation: The Purchasing Division requires all evaluators, advisors, and the agency procurement officer, despite the type of transaction, to sign a Certification of Non-Conflict of Interest form prior to contract award to ensure compliance with W. Va. Code § 5A-3-31 and § 6B-2-5 by affirming that they do not have a conflict of interest and did not communicate with the vendor during the solicitation, evaluation, and award period.

Transactions in Violation: (5 Instances)

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
06/30/2022	Dues	Advancing States Inc.	\$11,554.00	GAX,22*27738
09/20/2021	Technical assistant service	Jennifer J Fazzolari	\$2,800.00	GAX,22*21539
01/19/2022	Technical assistant service	Jennifer J Fazzolari	\$2,702.00	GAX,22*56444
12/31/2021	Dues	Meals on Wheels America	\$4,229.17	GAX,22*08402
10/29/2021	Conference	NCCNHR	\$4,800.00	PRCC,22*40328

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit include a properly completed Certification of Non-Conflict of Interest form prior to contract award for all transactions exceeding \$2,500.00 and maintain a copy in the contract file.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

Issue 10: Miscellaneous (OT Approval)

Authority: Procedures Handbook Section 7.3

Explanation: (Office of Technology Approval) Chief Information Officer Requisition Review is required by West Virginia State Code 5A-6 to review all proposed IT acquisitions. This review includes research to determine a solution's viability, compliance with standards and strategic direction, compatibility with existing infrastructure or requirements for infrastructure adaptation, and cost savings opportunities. Please reference the CIO policy CIO-19-001 Appendix B for all software and hardware pre-approved under \$5,000.00.

Transactions in Violation: (1 Instance)

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
04/26/2022	Software subscription	Adobe Acropro Subs	\$192.47	PRCC,22*23331

Additional Detail: Office of Technology approval was not found in the file.

Purchasing Division Recommendation:

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the agency apply for and receive Office of Technology approval prior to the purchase of any software or hardware not listed on the pre-approved list from the CIO-19-001 Policy. Approval memo must be maintained and kept in the procurement file.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the agency reference West Virginia Office of Technology CIO Policy # **CIO-19-001** for guidance, which can be found at <https://sites.google.com/wv.gov/othub/nonav/policies/cio-19-001> .
3. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on the topics listed herein that are offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

EXHIBIT B: COMPARISON WITH PRIOR INSPECTIONS

A previous inspection of the Bureau of Senior Services was conducted in March of 2021. The review consisted of 20 selected transactions from an approximate 472 total transactions from July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2020. This review resulted in 13 findings associated with 6 of the selected transactions. This indicated that 30% of the transactions reviewed during the inspection had one or more problems of potential nonconformity with Purchasing Division laws, rules, and/or regulations. When comparing the statistics from FY 2020 to the current FY 2022 inspection, below is a summary of the issues identified during the FY 2020 inspection, as compared to the findings from the current inspection.

Summary of Problem Transactions		
<i>Findings</i>	<i>FY 2020</i>	<i>FY 2022</i>
Failure to Bid at Central Level (Stringing)	0	0
Failure to Bid at Delegated Level	1	4
Statewide Contract not utilized	0	0
Vendor Registration unverified/wrong Fee Code	0	2
Failure to verify Compliance Checks	2	5
Purchasing Affidavit not included	1	0
wvOasis Award Document not issued	4	5
Asset Tag/Number not affixed	0	0
Cert. of Non-Conflict of Interest not included	4	5
Miscellaneous Issue	1	1
<i>Total</i>	13	22

There are multiple training resources available from the Purchasing Division in-house training program, as well as, through on-line training modules. These training resources would assist in educating procurement staff in purchasing procedures/requirements. Additional information can be obtained by contacting Samantha Knapp, Staff Development Specialist, at (304) 558-7022 or by visiting the Purchasing Division's website <http://www.state.wv.us/admin/purchase/training/default.html>.

EXHIBIT C: AGENCY TRAINING REPORT

Importance of Training: The Purchasing Division has found that training in procurement significantly improves the ability of the spending unit to comply with applicable provisions of the West Virginia Code, the Code of State Rules and the Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook.

Statutory Requirements:

- W. Va. Code § 5A-3-60 requires that All executive department secretaries, commissioners, deputy commissioners, assistant commissioners, directors, deputy directors, assistant directors, department heads, deputy department heads and assistant department heads are hereby required to take two hours of training on purchasing procedures and purchasing cards annually.
- W. Va. CSR § 148-1-3.2 mandates that all designated procurement officers receive 10 hours of procurement training annually.

Available Training: The Purchasing Division has implemented a very robust training program that is available to all procurement officers subject to Purchasing Division oversight. That training includes:

- Online Modules
- Webinars
- Live Training Sessions
- Annual conferences
- Basic and Advanced Procurement Certification Programs
- Agency Specific Targeted Training

Training: The Purchasing Division records indicate that during the inspection period the following individuals within the spending unit have obtained training at our annual Purchasing Conference as shown below:

There were no attendees from the Bureau of Senior Services.

Purchasing Division Recommendations:

The Purchasing Division recommends that all procurement officers, regardless of their status as designated or undesignated, participate in at least 10 hours of training annually and that all officials subject to the training requirements in W. Va. Code § 5A-3-60 take the required 2 hours of Purchasing and P-Card Training.

EXHIBIT D: AGENCY RESPONSE TO INSPECTION FINDINGS



STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA
BUREAU OF SENIOR SERVICES
1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East
Charleston, West Virginia 25305-0160
Telephone (304) 558-3317
FAX (304) 558-5609
www.wvseniorservices.gov

Denise R Worley
Commissioner

To: Mitzie Howard, Inspector 2
Purchasing Division

From: Terry Hess, CFO

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Terry Hess".

Date: April 11, 2023

RE: Purchasing Review FY 2022

About the recent FY 2022 Purchasing Review, the Bureau agrees with all findings. With the hiring of a new Procurement Officer, certain remedies of the findings have already been implemented to ensure compliance with expected purchasing practices. The Bureau will continue to make improvements.

I appreciate your time and guidance in addressing our questions.