



ALLAN L. MCVEY  
CABINET SECRETARY

STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA  
DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATION  
PURCHASING DIVISION  
2019 WASHINGTON STREET, EAST  
CHARLESTON, WEST VIRGINIA 25305-0130

W. MICHAEL SHEETS  
DIRECTOR

May 1, 2020

Susan Combs, Executive Director  
West Virginia Board of Dentistry  
1319 Robert C. Byrd Drive  
P.O. Box 1447  
Crab Orchard, West Virginia 25827

Dear Executive Director Susan Combs:

This is to transmit the final copy of the Purchasing Review of the West Virginia Board of Dentistry. Should you feel a response is warranted; your comments will become part of the Inspection Report file.

A Corrective Action Plan will follow requesting your response to all of the compliance issues identified in this report.

Thank you for your cooperation and that of your staff during this review.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "W. Michael Sheets".

W. Michael Sheets, CPPO  
Director  
West Virginia Purchasing Division

Enclosure:

cc: Christina Lesko, Administrative Assistant, West Virginia Board of Dentistry

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. <i>Introduction</i> .....	2
2. <i>Scope of Inspection</i> .....	3
3. <i>Inspection Summary</i> .....	4
4. <i>Findings Grid and Grading Sheet</i> .....	5
5. <i>Detailed Inspection Findings</i> .....	<i>Exhibit A</i>
6. <i>Comparison with Prior Inspections</i> .....	<i>Exhibit B</i>
7. <i>Agency Training Report</i> .....	<i>Exhibit C</i>

---

## **INTRODUCTION**

The Purchasing Division is broadly charged with the development and oversight of the procurement functions of state spending units under its authority. That authority is found in Chapter 5A, Article 3 of the West Virginia Code, and Title 148, Series 1, of the West Virginia Code of State Rules. That mandate requires that the Purchasing Division “appoint inspectors to review and audit spending unit requests and purchases and other transactions and performance.” W. Va. CSR § 148-1-4.14. The Purchasing Division’s Inspection Services Unit performs this function by regularly conducting inspections of all spending units subject to Purchasing Division oversight.

The Purchasing Division Inspection Services Unit conducted a remote inspection of the West Virginia Board of Dentistry for the period of July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2019. Notice of the inspection was provided on March 18, 2020, and the inspection commenced on April 22, 2020. The results of the inspection are contained within this report.

## SCOPE

The scope of the inspection was focused on determining whether the West Virginia Board of Dentistry's procurement transactions for the period of July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2019 were, in all material respects, in compliance with applicable provisions of the West Virginia Code, the Code of State Rules and the Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook in effect during that time period.

Inspectors utilized spending unit payment transactions to identify potential violations with a primary focus on those transactions processed at the spending unit level without Purchasing Division involvement. Those transactions included, but were not limited to, agency delegated procurements, Section 9 procurements, agency delivery orders, General Accounting Expenditure ("GAX") payments, and P-Card payments. Notwithstanding this general focus, however, Inspectors can review any transaction or internal procurement operating procedures that they deem relevant.

As noted above, the transaction review was conducted to ensure compliance with applicable provisions of the West Virginia Code, the Code of State Rules and the Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook. More specifically, the scope of the inspection included, but was not limited to, an examination to determine if any of the following infractions had been committed:

- (1) Failure to bid at central level (Stringing)[Required to be reported to the Legislature twice annually]
- (2) Internal resources not utilized,
- (3) Statewide contract not utilized,
- (4) Failure to bid at delegated level,
- (5) Vendor registration unverified and wrong vendor fee exemption code utilized
- (6) Failure to verify compliance checks
  - a. Unemployment
  - b. Workers' compensation
  - c. Vendor status with Secretary of State's office
  - d. Debarred vendor list
- (7) Failure to include notarized Purchasing Affidavit,
- (8) Failure to issue wvOASIS procurement award document,
- (9) Lack of compliance with fixed asset requirements (asset tags),
- (10) Failure to include Certification of Non-Conflict of Interest form,
- (11) Miscellaneous Issues
  - a. Improper award (Unjustified award to other than lowest responsible bidder meeting specifications),
  - b. Leases exceeding six months not processed centrally
  - c. Other as needed

## SUMMARY

During the period under review, the spending unit processed 228 procurement transactions with a value of \$78,468.99. (These amounts are approximate, subject to reporting limitations from wvOASIS (including possible data entry error) and errors caused by elimination of duplicate results). Of those transactions, the Inspector selected 11 for review which represents approximately 4% of the total. This inspection of 11 selected transactions yielded 8 findings associated with 4 of the selected transactions. This means that approximately 36% of the transactions reviewed had one or more instances of noncompliance with applicable provisions of the West Virginia Code, the Code of State Rules and the Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook. The findings are further illustrated in the attached Findings Grid and Grading Sheet.

The inspection also revealed that on 0 occasions, the spending unit failed to obtain competitive bids as required by the applicable dollar level of spend. That number is comprised of 0 instances of failing to bid at the central level (also known as stringing), and 0 instances of failing to bid at the delegated level. Any instances of failure to bid at the central level will be reported to the Legislature as required by the West Virginia Code.

Based on the findings contained in this report, the Purchasing Division recommends the spending unit work to improve any areas of noncompliance. Given that the agency received a score of 76.8% C on the inspection and there was a pattern of findings or one or more cases of stringing, the first step must be the completion of a Corrective Action Plan. A request for which will be provided to you after this inspection is finalized.

## Grading Sheet

### West Virginia Board of Dentistry FY2019 Statistics

Transactions Reviewed	11
Non-Conformance Rate (See Summary Page)	36.0%
Conformance Rate	64.0%

Findings Summary				
Finding Category	Number of Findings	Finding Percentage	Points possible	Points Received
Stringing	0	0.00%	30	30
Statewide Contract	0	0.00%	15	15
Internal Resources	0	0.00%	15	15
Failure to Bid	0	0.00%	15	15
Vendor Registration	2	18.18%	5	2
Verification Searches	3	27.27%	5	0
Affidavit	0	0.00%	5	5
wvOasis Award Document	2	18.18%	3	1.2
Asset Tag/Number	0	0.00%	3	3
Certification of Non-Conflict of Interest	1	9.09%	3	2.4
Miscellaneous Issue	0	0.00%	1	1
<b>Total</b>	<b>8</b>		<b>100</b>	<b>89.6</b>

Overall Agency Score	
Non-Conformance & Findings Average	Overall Letter Grade
<b>76.8%</b>	<b>C</b>

Scale (See Weight Application*)
91.66 -- 100 = A
83.33 -- 91.65 = B
75 -- 83.32 = C
66.66 -- 74.99 = D
<66.65 = F

The Finding Summary and Number of Findings does not directly correlate with the Transactions Reviewed and Non-Conformance Rate because each transaction can yield multiple findings, and findings like stringing can include multiple transactions in a single finding.

---

## EXHIBIT A: DETAILED INSPECTION FINDINGS

---

### Issue 1: Failure to bid at central level (Stringing)

**Authority:** W. Va. Code § 5A-3-10; Procedures Handbook Section 6

**Explanation:** State law mandates that the Purchasing Division competitively bid for the purchase of commodities and services estimated to exceed twenty-five thousand dollars. The law also prohibits a spending unit from issuing a series of requisitions or divide or plan procurements to circumvent this twenty-five thousand dollar threshold. The transactions listed below violated this legal mandate and will be reported to the West Virginia Legislature as required by law.

**Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)**

#### **Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit establish central contracts through the Purchasing Division for each of the items included above and any other commodities or services that will exceed \$25,000 in a rolling 12 month period.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit utilize wvOASIS to create reports that will allow the spending unit to track spend and determine when spending is closing to exceeding the \$25,000 limit.
3. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit forecast future needs for its commodities and services to determine in advance what should be procured at the central level.
4. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

## **Issue 2: Internal Resource Not Utilized**

**Authority:** W. Va. Code §§ 25-7-5 and 5A-3-10; Procedures Handbook Section 3.6.1

**Explanation:** State law mandates that certain social welfare programs be utilized prior to a spending unit obtaining commodities and services in the open market. Those programs include the Sheltered Workshops established to assist disabled individuals in finding employment, and the Correctional Industries program that provides prison inmates with meaningful work. The transactions listed below should have been obtained from one of these programs, or a waiver should have been obtained. The inspection revealed that the transactions were outside of the internal programs and no waiver was granted.

**Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)**

### **Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit personnel become familiar with what is available from internal sources and either procure those commodities and services from internal sources or obtain a waiver from the Purchasing Division.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.



### **Issue 3: Statewide Contract Not Utilized**

**Authority:** W. Va. CSR § 148-1-7.4.c.; Procedures Handbook Section 3.6.2

**Explanation:** The Purchasing Division has authority to establish contracts at a statewide level to secure economies of scale that would not be possible on an agency by agency basis. Once established, the Purchasing Division can mandate that spending units utilize those statewide contracts. For the transactions listed below, the spending unit has obtained the commodity or service in question outside of an available statewide contract without a valid waiver.

**Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)**

**Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit personnel become familiar with what is available from statewide contracts and either procure those commodities and services from statewide contracts or obtain a waiver from the Purchasing Division.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

#### **Issue 4: Failure to bid at delegated level**

**Authority:** W. Va. Code § 5A-3-11(a); W. Va. CSR § 148-1-7.2; Procedures Handbook Section 5

**Explanation:** The Purchasing Division has established competitive bidding requirements that spending units must follow when procuring commodities and services below \$25,000, and above \$2,500.01. For those transactions listed below, the spending unit has failed to obtain and document competitive bids as required.

**Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)**

#### **Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit follow the requirements associated with each delegated spending limit.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit utilize wvOASIS to create reports that will allow the spending unit to track spend and determine when spending is closing to exceeding spending limits.
3. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit forecast future needs for its commodities and services to determine in advance what should be competitively bid at delegated verbal and written bid levels.
4. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward

**Issue 5: Vendor Registration Unverified/Wrong Vendor Fee Exemption Code Utilized**

**Authority:** W. Va. CSR § 148-1-6.1; Procedures Handbook Section 4

**Explanation:** The agency must verify that the vendor is registered, and the registration fee paid, if applicable. The registration process includes having the proper disclosure of information in the wvOASIS vendor/customer account. Certain vendors are exempted from paying the vendor registration fee mandated by the authority referenced above. wvOASIS has created fee exemption codes that allow the spending unit to designate the appropriate exemption code on a transactional basis.

**Transactions in Violation: (2 Instances)**

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
06/30/2019	Membership	AM Assoc. of Dental Boards	\$6,085.00	GAX,0909,1900011072

**Additional Detail:** Although the spending unit is declaring this transaction as an exemption under Section 9, the file still must contain all required documentation for that dollar amount. Due to this being a GAX payment, the standard Oasis verification searches were not completed.

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
02/06/2019	Postage	Reserve Account Pitney Bowes	\$3,000.00	GAX,0909,1900072899

**Additional Detail:** Due to this being a GAX payment and no documentation in the file, the standard Oasis verification searches were not completed.

**Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchase Division recommends that the spending unit only utilize vendor fee exemption codes for transactions that would allow a vendor to avoid paying the vendor registration fee.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.
3. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit contact the Vendor Registration section within the Purchasing Division if there is uncertainty about when and how to apply a vendor fee exemption code.

**Issue 6: Failure to Verify Compliance Checks**

**(Workers Comp, Unemployment, Sec. of State, Debarment)**

**Authority:** W. Va. CSR § 148-1-6.1.e.; Procedures Handbook Section 5.3.1.6.

**Explanation:** The authority cited above requires that a vendor be licensed and in good standing in accordance with all state and local laws and requirements by any state or local agency of West Virginia, including, but not limited to, the West Virginia Secretary of State's Office, the West Virginia Tax Department, West Virginia Insurance Commission, or other state agencies or political subdivisions prior to being awarded a contract. The mandated compliance checks were not included in the transactions listed below.

**Transactions in Violation: (3 Instances)**

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
03/14/2019	Expert Witness	DJS Associates Inc	\$2,137.50	PRM,0909,1900050900

**Additional Detail:** Although the above transaction may fall under Section 9, the transaction still requires all verification and compliance checks. The agreement was for \$10,000.00 and should have contained documentation for that dollar amount.

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
02/06/2019	Postage	Reserve Account Pitney Bowes	\$3,000.00	GAX,0909,1900072899

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
06/30/2019	Rehab Services	WV Pharmacist Recovery Network	\$3,750.00	PRM,0909,2000000875

**Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit perform all compliance checks mandated by the Handbook and properly document those compliance checks in the contract file.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward

### **Issue 7: Purchasing Affidavit Not Included**

**Authority:** W. Va. Code §§ 5A-3-10a and 5-22-1; Procedures Handbook Section 5.3.1.6.

**Explanation:** West Virginia law has several restrictions against awarding a contract to a vendor that owes a debt to the State or its political subdivisions. The Purchasing Affidavit must be signed by the vendor prior to contract award to obtain assurance that the vendor is in compliance with the statutory mandates.

**Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)**

#### **Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit obtain a properly completed Purchasing Affidavit and maintain a copy in the contract file for all transactions exceeding \$10,000.01 (the threshold for obtaining written bids).
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

**Issue 8: wvOASIS Award Document Not Issued**

**Authority:** Procedures Handbook Section 5.2.2

**Explanation:** The Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook requires that a procurement award document be issued for all purchases exceeding \$2,500 in value. This requirement ensures that the transaction is recorded in wvOASIS in a way that allows it to be easily identified and tracked and helps to prevent spending in violation of procurement laws, rules, and procedures.

**Transactions in Violation: (2 Instances)**

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
06/30/2019	Membership	AM Assoc. of Dental Boards	\$6,085.00	GAX,0909,1900011072

**Additional Detail:** Although the above transactions may fall under Section 9, the exemption only applies to bidding and the payment of the vendor registration fee. All other documentation must still be present in the file.

02/06/2019	Postage	Reserve Account Pitney Bowes	\$3,000.00	GAX,0909,1900072899
------------	---------	---------------------------------	------------	---------------------

**Additional Detail:** There was no indication that an agency wvOASIS award document was issued.

**Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit issue a purchase order through wvOASIS and maintain a copy in the contract file for all transactions exceeding \$2,500.01.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

### **Issue 9: Asset Tag Not Affixed**

**Authority:** W. Va. Code § 5A-3-34; Surplus Property Operations Manual, Part II, Section 1.4

**Explanation:** The Surplus Property Operations Manual requires that all reportable assets must have a numbered identification tag affixed to the asset. Agencies are responsible for obtaining and placing the proper tags on the assets. This method of tagging assets helps to easily identify state assets during physical inspection and to guard against asset theft.

**Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)**

#### **Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit obtain a properly affix asset tags to all reportable assets. In conjunction with this, the spending unit must maintain accurate inventory records in wvOASIS.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

**Issue 10: Cert. of Non-Conflict Not Included**

**Authority:** W. Va. Code §§ 5A-3-31 and 6B-2-5; Procedures Handbook Section 3.7.7.

**Explanation:** The Purchasing Division requires all evaluators, advisors, and the agency procurement officer, despite the type of transaction, to sign a Certification of Non-Conflict of Interest form prior to contract award to ensure compliance with W. Va. Code § 5A-3-31 and § 6B-2-5 by affirming that they do not have a conflict of interest and did not communicate with the vendor during the solicitation, evaluation, and award period.

**Transactions in Violation: (1 Instance)**

<u>Date</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Invoice</u>
02/06/2019	Postage	Reserve Account Pitney Bowes	\$3,000.00	GAX,0909,1900072899

**Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit include a properly completed Certification of Non-Conflict of Interest form prior to contract award for all transactions exceeding \$2,500.01 and maintain a copy in the contract file.
2. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on this topic offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.



## **Issue 11: Miscellaneous**

**Authority: Various**

**Explanation:** Over the course of the inspection, various miscellaneous issues are often identified. Those items are included in this section.

**Transactions in Violation: (0 Instances)**

### **Purchasing Division Recommendation:**

1. The Purchasing Division recommends that the spending unit's procurement officer participate in training on the topics listed herein that are offered by the Purchasing Division and ensure that all procurement staff understand how to comply with this requirement moving forward.

---

## EXHIBIT B: COMPARISON WITH PRIOR INSPECTIONS

---

A previous inspection of the West Virginia Board of Dentistry was conducted in May of 2018. The review consisted of 7 selected transactions from an approximate 161 total transactions from July 1, 2016 through June 30, 2017. This review resulted in 6 findings associated with 9 of the selected transactions. This indicated that 42% of the transactions reviewed during the inspection had one or more problems of potential nonconformity with Purchasing Division laws, rules, and/or regulations. When comparing the statistics from 2017 to the current 2019 inspection, below is a summary of the issues identified during the 2017 inspection, as compared to the findings from the current inspection.

<b>Summary of Problem Transactions</b>		
<b><i>Findings</i></b>	<b>2017</b>	<b>2019</b>
Failure to Bid at Central Level (Stringing)	0	0
Internal Resources not utilized	0	0
Statewide Contract not utilized	0	0
Failure to Bid at Delegated Level	0	0
Vendor Registration unverified/wrong Fee Code	0	2
Failure to verify Compliance Checks	0	3
Purchasing Affidavit not included	0	0
wvOasis Award Document not issued	3	2
Asset Tag/Number not affixed	0	0
Cert. of Non-Conflict of Interest not included	3	1
Miscellaneous Issue	0	0
<b><i>Total</i></b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>

There are multiple training resources available from the Purchasing Division in-house training program, as well as, through on-line training modules. These training resources would assist in educating procurement staff in purchasing procedures/requirements. Additional information can be obtained by contacting Samantha Knapp, Staff Development Specialist, at (304) 558-7022 or by visiting the Purchasing Division's website

<http://www.state.wv.us/admin/purchase/training/default.html>.

---

## EXHIBIT C: AGENCY TRAINING REPORT

---

**Importance of Training:** The Purchasing Division has found that training in procurement significantly improves the ability of the spending unit to comply with applicable provisions of the West Virginia Code, the Code of State Rules and the Purchasing Division Procedures Handbook.

**Statutory Requirements:**

- W. Va. Code § 5A-3-60 requires that All executive department secretaries, commissioners, deputy commissioners, assistant commissioners, directors, deputy directors, assistant directors, department heads, deputy department heads and assistant department heads are hereby required to take two hours of training on purchasing procedures and purchasing cards annually.
- W. Va. CSR § 148-1-3.2 mandates that all designated procurement officers receive 10 hours of procurement training annually.

**Available Training:** The Purchasing Division has implemented a very robust training program that is available to all procurement officers subject to Purchasing Division oversight. That training includes:

- Online Modules
- Webinars
- Live Training Sessions
- Annual conferences
- Basic and Advanced Procurement Certification Programs
- Agency Specific Targeted Training

**Training:** The Purchasing Division records indicate that during the inspection period the following individuals within the spending unit have obtained training at our annual Purchasing Conference as shown below:

*There were no attendees from the West Virginia Board of Dentistry.*

**Purchasing Division Recommendations:**

The Purchasing Division recommends that all procurement officers, regardless of their status as designated or undesignated, participate in at least 10 hours of training annually and that all officials subject to the training requirements in W. Va. Code § 5A-3-60 take the required 2 hours of Purchasing and P-Card Training.